

---

# Contents

---

|                           |          |
|---------------------------|----------|
| <b>Introduction .....</b> | <b>1</b> |
|---------------------------|----------|

## **Part One   Prestudy Planning**

|                    |                                                                     |           |
|--------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| <b>Chapter One</b> | <b>The Evolution of Protections for Research Participants .....</b> | <b>5</b>  |
|                    | 1.1. Brief History .....                                            | 5         |
|                    | 1.2. The Role of Institutional Review Boards .....                  | 8         |
|                    | 1.3. Ethical Review in the Host Country .....                       | 10        |
|                    | Australia .....                                                     | 10        |
|                    | The Netherlands .....                                               | 11        |
|                    | Uganda .....                                                        | 11        |
|                    | 1.4. Conclusion .....                                               | 12        |
| <b>Chapter Two</b> | <b>Governing Principles .....</b>                                   | <b>13</b> |
|                    | 2.1. Balancing the Risks and Benefits .....                         | 14        |
|                    | Assessing Risk .....                                                | 14        |
|                    | Assessing Benefits .....                                            | 16        |
|                    | Balancing the Risks and Benefits .....                              | 16        |
|                    | 2.2. Informed Consent .....                                         | 18        |
|                    | Assessing Capacity .....                                            | 19        |
|                    | Information .....                                                   | 23        |
|                    | Comprehension .....                                                 | 27        |
|                    | 2.3. Voluntariness .....                                            | 30        |
|                    | Participation of Prisoners .....                                    | 30        |
|                    | Participation of Children .....                                     | 37        |

---

|                      |                                                                           |    |
|----------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
|                      | AIDS Dementia .....                                                       | 40 |
|                      | Research in Developing Countries .....                                    | 40 |
|                      | Use of Payment as an Incentive .....                                      | 42 |
|                      | The Health Care Provider or Social<br>Service Provider as Recruiter ..... | 44 |
| 2.4.                 | Conclusion .....                                                          | 44 |
| <b>Chapter Three</b> | <b>Clinical Trials</b> .....                                              | 47 |
| 3.1.                 | Basic Principles of Clinical Trials .....                                 | 47 |
|                      | The Design of Randomized Clinical<br>Trials .....                         | 47 |
|                      | The Mechanics of Randomized Clinical<br>Trials .....                      | 52 |
|                      | Crossover Designs .....                                                   | 54 |
| 3.2.                 | Ethical Principles and HIV-Related<br>Clinical Trials .....               | 55 |
|                      | Beneficence .....                                                         | 55 |
|                      | Autonomy.....                                                             | 55 |
|                      | Justice and Fairness .....                                                | 57 |
| 3.3.                 | The Special Case of HIV Vaccine<br>Trials .....                           | 60 |
| 3.4.                 | Conclusion .....                                                          | 62 |
| <b>Chapter Four</b>  | <b>Recruitment</b> .....                                                  | 63 |
| 4.1.                 | Standards for Recruitment .....                                           | 63 |
|                      | Background .....                                                          | 63 |
|                      | Current Regulations .....                                                 | 65 |
| 4.2.                 | Barriers to Recruitment .....                                             | 66 |
|                      | Access to the Investigational Drug .....                                  | 66 |
|                      | Distrust of Public Health Authorities ...                                 | 66 |
|                      | Stigmatization .....                                                      | 68 |
|                      | Economic Factors .....                                                    | 68 |
|                      | Legal Difficulties .....                                                  | 69 |
| 4.3.                 | Participant Motivations for<br>Volunteering .....                         | 71 |
| 4.4.                 | Methods and Strategies for<br>Recruitment .....                           | 72 |
|                      | Methods .....                                                             | 72 |
|                      | Strategies .....                                                          | 74 |
| 4.5.                 | Conclusion .....                                                          | 75 |

## PartTwo Issues Arising during the Study

|                     |                                                                                        |            |
|---------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| <b>Chapter Five</b> | <b>Confidentiality .....</b>                                                           | <b>79</b>  |
|                     | 5.1. State Limits on Confidentiality .....                                             | 81         |
|                     | Public Health Reporting Requirements .....                                             | 81         |
|                     | Abuse and Neglect Laws .....                                                           | 86         |
|                     | Partner Notification Laws .....                                                        | 87         |
|                     | The Duty to Warn .....                                                                 | 88         |
|                     | Subpoenas .....                                                                        | 91         |
|                     | State Information Laws .....                                                           | 94         |
|                     | 5.2. Federal Limits on Confidentiality .....                                           | 95         |
|                     | The Freedom of Information Act .....                                                   | 95         |
|                     | Agency Audit Requirements .....                                                        | 97         |
|                     | 5.3. Mechanisms for the Protection of Confidentiality .....                            | 97         |
|                     | Implementing Security Measures .....                                                   | 98         |
|                     | Certificates of Confidentiality .....                                                  | 106        |
|                     | Other Federal Statutory Protections .....                                              | 107        |
|                     | Minimizing FOIA Intrusions .....                                                       | 110        |
|                     | Minimizing the Impact of Audit Procedures .....                                        | 112        |
|                     | Motions to Quash Subpoenas .....                                                       | 112        |
|                     | 5.4. Confidentiality Protections outside the United States .....                       | 116        |
|                     | Australia .....                                                                        | 116        |
|                     | 5.5. Duty to Inform Participants .....                                                 | 116        |
|                     | 5.6. Conclusion .....                                                                  | 117        |
| <b>Chapter Six</b>  | <b>Potential Conflicts .....</b>                                                       | <b>119</b> |
|                     | 6.1. Reconciling Treatment Goals and Research Goals: The Nonadherent Participant ..... | 119        |
|                     | 6.2. Participant Loss of Capacity .....                                                | 120        |
|                     | Design Issues .....                                                                    | 120        |
|                     | Ethical Issues .....                                                                   | 121        |
|                     | 6.3. Advance Directives and the Research Study.....                                    | 123        |
|                     | 6.4. Researcher Conflicts of Interest .....                                            | 124        |
|                     | Altruism.....                                                                          | 131        |
|                     | Recognition .....                                                                      | 131        |
|                     | Financial Gain .....                                                                   | 132        |

|                      |                                                                        |            |
|----------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
|                      | Controlling Conflict of Interest .....                                 | 134        |
|                      | 6.5. Conclusion .....                                                  | 136        |
| <b>Chapter Seven</b> | <b>Scientific Misconduct .....</b>                                     | <b>137</b> |
|                      | 7.1. Defining Scientific Misconduct .....                              | 137        |
|                      | The Role of Investigator Intent .....                                  | 138        |
|                      | 7.2. Scientific Misconduct Investigations .....                        | 139        |
|                      | Procedures .....                                                       | 139        |
|                      | Sanctions .....                                                        | 140        |
|                      | 7.3. Reducing the Potential for Scientific<br>Misconduct .....         | 141        |
|                      | 7.4. Conclusion .....                                                  | 141        |
|                      | <br><b>Part Three Following the Study</b>                              |            |
| <b>Chapter Eight</b> | <b>Participants and Records .....</b>                                  | <b>145</b> |
|                      | 8.1. Legal Liability for Injury to Research<br>Participants .....      | 145        |
|                      | 8.2. Sharing Data .....                                                | 147        |
|                      | 8.3. Conclusion .....                                                  | 148        |
| <b>Chapter Nine</b>  | <b>Publication and the Dissemination of<br/>Research Results .....</b> | <b>149</b> |
|                      | 9.1. Authorship and Professional<br>Publication .....                  | 149        |
|                      | 9.2. Communicating Results to the Public<br>and to Participants .....  | 151        |
|                      | Acknowledging Uncertainty .....                                        | 151        |
|                      | Communicating Results and Errors ..                                    | 151        |
|                      | Participants as a Special Class .....                                  | 152        |
|                      | 9.3. Conclusion .....                                                  | 152        |
|                      | <br><b>Part Four New Roles for the HIV Researcher</b>                  |            |
| <b>Chapter Ten</b>   | <b>An Overview of the Legal System .....</b>                           | <b>157</b> |
|                      | 10.1. The Constitution .....                                           | 157        |
|                      | 10.2. Statutes .....                                                   | 158        |
|                      | 10.3. Rules and Regulations .....                                      | 158        |
|                      | 10.4. The Judiciary .....                                              | 159        |
|                      | 10.5. Conclusion .....                                                 | 159        |

|                         |                                                                  |            |
|-------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| <b>Chapter Eleven</b>   | <b>The HIV Researcher as an Expert Witness .....</b>             | <b>161</b> |
| 11.1.                   | The Court System .....                                           | 161        |
|                         | The Federal Court System .....                                   | 161        |
|                         | The State Court System .....                                     | 162        |
| 11.2.                   | The Process of Civil Litigation .....                            | 163        |
|                         | Complaint and Answer .....                                       | 164        |
|                         | Discovery.....                                                   | 165        |
| 11.3.                   | The Process of Criminal Litigation .....                         | 167        |
| 11.4.                   | Considerations in Serving as an<br>Expert Witness .....          | 169        |
|                         | The Ethics of Participating as an<br>Expert Witness .....        | 169        |
|                         | Motivations for Participating as an<br>Expert Witness .....      | 170        |
| 11.5.                   | Standards for the Expert Witness .....                           | 171        |
|                         | The Admissibility of Evidence .....                              | 171        |
|                         | Reconciling Legal Causation and<br>Scientific Causation .....    | 173        |
| 11.6.                   | Conclusion .....                                                 | 176        |
| <b>Chapter Twelve</b>   | <b>The HIV Researcher and Legislative<br/>Advocacy.....</b>      | <b>177</b> |
| 12.1.                   | The Legislative Process .....                                    | 177        |
|                         | Federal Legislation— An Overview ..                              | 177        |
|                         | State Legislation— An Overview .....                             | 178        |
| 12.2.                   | The Ethics of Participating as an<br>Advocate .....              | 179        |
| 12.3.                   | Case Example: Legislation for a<br>Needle Exchange Program ..... | 180        |
|                         | Preliminary Issues .....                                         | 180        |
|                         | Drafting the Legislation .....                                   | 183        |
|                         | Seeking Sponsorship .....                                        | 184        |
|                         | Introduction of the Bill and<br>Committee Action .....           | 184        |
|                         | Appropriations .....                                             | 185        |
| 12.4.                   | Conclusion .....                                                 | 186        |
| <b>Chapter Thirteen</b> | <b>The HIV Researcher in the Regulatory<br/>Arena .....</b>      | <b>187</b> |
| 13.1.                   | The Regulatory Process .....                                     | 187        |
|                         | The Federal Process .....                                        | 187        |
|                         | California Regulatory Procedures ....                            | 190        |
| 13.2.                   | The Ethics of Regulatory Advocacy .....                          | 193        |

|                                                                      |     |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 13.3. Case Example: Regulations<br>Relating to Clinical Trials ..... | 193 |
| 13.4. Conclusion .....                                               | 194 |
| <b>Conclusion</b> .....                                              | 195 |
| <b>References</b> .....                                              | 197 |
| <b>Index</b> .....                                                   | 215 |