Contents

Prefac	e	ix
Ackno	wledgments	xi
Part I	Themes in Pap's Philosophical Writings	
Introdu		3
	d Shieh	
1.	Overview of Pap's Philosophical Work	3
2.	Necessity as Analyticity	10
3.	Necessity as (Implicit) Linguistic Convention	12
4.	The Analytic-Synthetic Distinction: Hypothetical or Functional Necessity	15
5.	The Analytic-Synthetic Distinction: Dispositional and Open Concepts	16
6.	The Limits of Hypothetical Necessity: Formal or Absolute Necessity	23
7.	Logical Consequence and Material Entailment	24
8.	The Method of Conceivability	27
9.	Comparison with Necessity in Contemporary Analytic Metaphysics	30
10.		33
11.	e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e	42
Part II	Analyticity, A Priority and Necessity	
1	M ' (M) ' (1040)	47
On the	Meaning of Necessity (1943)	47
2 The Di	fferent Kinds of A Priori (1944)	57
2	, ,	
3 Logic a	and the Synthetic A Priori (1949)	77
4		
Are all	Necessary Propositions Analytic? (1949)	91

Note on the "Semantic" and the "Absolute" Concepts of Truth (1952) Appendix: Rejoinder to Mrs. Robbins (1953) 7 Propositions, Sentences, and the Semantic Definition of Truth (1954) 8 Belief and Propositions (1957) 9 Semantic Examination of Realism (1947) 1. Universals in Re and the Resemblance Theory 2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 233 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 233 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237	vi	Contents
1. Are there Necessary Propositions? 2. The Confusion of Sentence and Proposition 3. Are Propositions "Logical Constructions"? 4. Necessary Truth and Semantic Systems 5. Implicit Definitions Part III Semantic Analysis: Truth, Propositions, and Realism 6 Note on the "Semantic" and the "Absolute" Concepts of Truth (1952) Appendix: Rejoinder to Mrs. Robbins (1953) 7 Propositions, Sentences, and the Semantic Definition of Truth (1954) 8 Belief and Propositions (1957) 9 Semantic Examination of Realism (1947) 1. Universals in Re and the Resemblance Theory 2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 233 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 235	5	
2. The Confusion of Sentence and Proposition 3. Are Propositions "Logical Constructions"? 4. Necessary Truth and Semantic Systems 5. Implicit Definitions Part III Semantic Analysis: Truth, Propositions, and Realism 6 Note on the "Semantic" and the "Absolute" Concepts of Truth (1952) Appendix: Rejoinder to Mrs. Robbins (1953) 7 Propositions, Sentences, and the Semantic Definition of Truth (1954) 8 Belief and Propositions (1957) 9 Semantic Examination of Realism (1947) 1. Universals in Re and the Resemblance Theory 2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 233 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 235	Necessary Propositions and Linguistic Rules (1955)	109
3. Are Propositions "Logical Constructions"? 4. Necessary Truth and Semantic Systems 5. Implicit Definitions 137 Part III Semantic Analysis: Truth, Propositions, and Realism 6 Note on the "Semantic" and the "Absolute" Concepts of Truth (1952) Appendix: Rejoinder to Mrs. Robbins (1953) 7 Propositions, Sentences, and the Semantic Definition of Truth (1954) 8 Belief and Propositions (1957) 9 Semantic Examination of Realism (1947) 1. Universals in Re and the Resemblance Theory 2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals 187 Part IV Philosophy of Logic and Mathematics 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 12 Satisfact In Inc. 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 15	1. Are there Necessary Propositions?	109
4. Necessary Truth and Semantic Systems 5. Implicit Definitions 137 Part III Semantic Analysis: Truth, Propositions, and Realism 6 Note on the "Semantic" and the "Absolute" Concepts of Truth (1952) Appendix: Rejoinder to Mrs. Robbins (1953) 154 7 Propositions, Sentences, and the Semantic Definition of Truth (1954) 155 8 Belief and Propositions (1957) 165 9 Semantic Examination of Realism (1947) 1. Universals in Re and the Resemblance Theory 2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals 187 Part IV Philosophy of Logic and Mathematics 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 205 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 213 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 233 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 233 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237	2. The Confusion of Sentence and Proposition	117
5. Implicit Definitions 137 Part III Semantic Analysis: Truth, Propositions, and Realism 6 Note on the "Semantic" and the "Absolute" Concepts of Truth (1952) 147 Appendix: Rejoinder to Mrs. Robbins (1953) 154 7 Propositions, Sentences, and the Semantic Definition of Truth (1954) 155 8 Belief and Propositions (1957) 165 9 Semantic Examination of Realism (1947) 181 1. Universals in Re and the Resemblance Theory 181 2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals 187 Part IV Philosophy of Logic and Mathematics 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 197 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 205 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 213 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 226 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 233 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 233	3. Are Propositions "Logical Constructions"?	122
Part III Semantic Analysis: Truth, Propositions, and Realism 6 Note on the "Semantic" and the "Absolute" Concepts of Truth (1952) 147 Appendix: Rejoinder to Mrs. Robbins (1953) 154 7 Propositions, Sentences, and the Semantic Definition of Truth (1954) 155 8 Belief and Propositions (1957) 165 9 Semantic Examination of Realism (1947) 181 1. Universals in Re and the Resemblance Theory 181 2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals 187 Part IV Philosophy of Logic and Mathematics 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 197 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 205 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 213 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 216 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 219 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 226 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 233 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237	4. Necessary Truth and Semantic Systems	132
Note on the "Semantic" and the "Absolute" Concepts of Truth (1952) Appendix: Rejoinder to Mrs. Robbins (1953) 7 Propositions, Sentences, and the Semantic Definition of Truth (1954) 8 Belief and Propositions (1957) 9 Semantic Examination of Realism (1947) 1. Universals in Re and the Resemblance Theory 2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 233 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 233 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237	5. Implicit Definitions	137
Note on the "Semantic" and the "Absolute" Concepts of Truth (1952) Appendix: Rejoinder to Mrs. Robbins (1953) 7 Propositions, Sentences, and the Semantic Definition of Truth (1954) 8 Belief and Propositions (1957) 9 Semantic Examination of Realism (1947) 1. Universals in Re and the Resemblance Theory 2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals 187 Part IV Philosophy of Logic and Mathematics 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 237 15		
Appendix: Rejoinder to Mrs. Robbins (1953) 7 Propositions, Sentences, and the Semantic Definition of Truth (1954) 8 Belief and Propositions (1957) 9 Semantic Examination of Realism (1947) 1. Universals in Re and the Resemblance Theory 2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals 187 Part IV Philosophy of Logic and Mathematics 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 205 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 15		147
Propositions, Sentences, and the Semantic Definition of Truth (1954) 8 Belief and Propositions (1957) 9 Semantic Examination of Realism (1947) 1. Universals in Re and the Resemblance Theory 2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals Part IV Philosophy of Logic and Mathematics 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 205 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 237 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237	•	
Propositions, Sentences, and the Semantic Definition of Truth (1954) 8 Belief and Propositions (1957) 9 Semantic Examination of Realism (1947) 1. Universals in Re and the Resemblance Theory 2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals 187 Part IV Philosophy of Logic and Mathematics 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 205 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 213 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 226 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 237 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237		134
8 Belief and Propositions (1957) 165 9 Semantic Examination of Realism (1947) 181 1. Universals in Re and the Resemblance Theory 181 2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals 187 Part IV Philosophy of Logic and Mathematics 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 197 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 205 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 213 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 213 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 216 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 219 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 226 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 233 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237		155
Belief and Propositions (1957) Semantic Examination of Realism (1947) 1. Universals in Re and the Resemblance Theory 2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals Part IV Philosophy of Logic and Mathematics 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 205 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 226 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 237 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237		
Semantic Examination of Realism (1947) 1. Universals in Re and the Resemblance Theory 2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals Part IV Philosophy of Logic and Mathematics 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 205 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 237 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237	Belief and Propositions (1957)	165
1. Universals in Re and the Resemblance Theory 2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals Part IV Philosophy of Logic and Mathematics 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 205 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 226 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 237 24 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237	9	
2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 205 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 226 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 237 15	Semantic Examination of Realism (1947)	181
Part IV Philosophy of Logic and Mathematics 10 Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 205 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 233 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237	1. Universals <i>in Re</i> and the Resemblance Theory	181
Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 205 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 226 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 237 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237	2. Platonism and the Existence of Universals	187
Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950) 11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 205 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 226 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 237 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237	Part IV Philosophy of Logic and Mathematics	
11 Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 205 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 226 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 237 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237	10	
Strict Implication, Entailment, and Modal Iteration (1955) 205 12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 226 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 237 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237	Logic and the Concept of Entailment (1950)	197
12 Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 226 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 237 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237	11 Strict Implication Entailment and Model Iteration (1055)	205
Mathematics, Abstract Entities, and Modern Semantics (1957) 1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 226 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 237 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237	-	203
1. Traditional Problem of Universals 2. Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute 3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 233 24 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237		213
 Modern Semantics and the Traditional Dispute Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237 		213
3. Classes, Attributes, and the Logical Analysis of Mathematics 4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 233 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237		
4. What Do the Ontological Questions Mean? 226 13 Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 233 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237	1	
Extensionality, Attributes, and Classes (1958) 233 14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237		
14 A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237		222
A Note on Logic and Existence (1947) 237		233
15		237
		231
	The Linguistic Hierarchy and the Vicious-Circle Principle (1954)	243

THE LIMITS OF LOGICAL EMPIRICISM	vii
Part V Philosophy of Mind	
 Other Minds and the Principle of Verifiability (1951) The Principle of Verifiability as Generator of Philosophical Theories The Behaviorist's Confusion about the Notion of Verifiability Are Statements about Other Minds Conclusively Verifiable? Physicalism as an Analytic Thesis 	249 s 249 254 259 264
17 Semantic Analysis and Psycho-Physical Dualism (1952)	269
Part VI Philosophy of Science	
18 The Concept of Absolute Emergence (1951)	285
19 Reduction Sentences and Open Concepts (1953) Appendix 20	295 316 317
Extensional Logic and Laws of Nature (1955) 21 Disposition Concepts and Extensional Logic (1958)	327
 Are Physical Magnitudes Operationally Definable? (1959) Operational Definition as Contextual Definition of Classificatory Predicates Operational Definition in the Form of Reduction Sentences Physical Magnitudes and the Language of Observables Theoretical Definition and Partial Interpretation The Breakdown of the Analytic-Synthetic Distinction for Partially Interpreted Systems 	351 351 352 355 358 360
Part VII Arthur Pap's Life and Writings	
23 Arthur Pap (1921-1959): Intellectual Biography of Arthur Pap Alfons Keupink	365
24 Arthur Pap: Biographical Notes Pauline Pap	369

viii		Contents
25		
A Bibliography of Arthur Pap		375
Alfons K	eupink	
1.	Main Publications	375
2.	Editions	375
3.	Translations	375
4.	Articles, Papers and Reviews	376
Reference	es	381
Index		393